JOHN JAY COLLEGE OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

Best Practices for the Recruitment and Retention of a Diverse Faculty

Faculty Development Day

Thursday, August 24, 2017 1:00pm – 2:00pm

Cheryl L. Franks, PhD, LMSW

John Jay's Mission Statement

- John Jay College of Criminal Justice is a community of motivated and intellectually committed individuals who explore justice in its many dimensions.
- Through their studies our students prepare for ethical leadership, global citizenship, and engaged service.
- Through their research our faculty advances knowledge and informs professional practices that build and sustain just societies.
- We foster an inclusive and diverse community drawn from our city, our country, and the world.
- We are dedicated to educating traditionally underrepresented groups and **committed to increasing diversity in the workforce.**
- The breadth of our community motivates us to question our assumptions, to consider multiple perspectives, to think critically, and to develop the humility that comes with global understanding.
- We educate fierce advocates for justice.

Diversity at John Jay

- Faculty Diversity Strategic Plan, 2013-2018
 - Goal One Recruitment
 - Goal Two
 Retention
 - Goal Three Improve Climate
- Revitalization of the Committee
 - Affirmative Action Committee
 - Diversity Committee
 - Diversity and Inclusion Committee
 - Future: Add Equity; Other
- Missing: The Position, The Location and a Diversity Mission and Vision Statement

Sample Diversity Mission and Vision Statement

Mission

 The Mailman School of Public Health's Office of Diversity, Culture, and Inclusion (ODCI) will facilitate the *creation of an inclusive and equitable campus community* committed to the development of public health practice and scholarship that reflects structural competency and cultural humility. Through a rich agenda of curricular and co-curricular activities that engage the multiple and intersecting dimensions of our social and cultural identities and *promote the recognition and understanding of historical and current social inequalities*, members of the Mailman community will learn to develop and implement action steps in our institution, community, and the broader field of public health necessary for the promotion of *health equity.*

Vision

 To ensure that Mailman is a school of public health where diversity is recognized, respected, valued, and celebrated and where education, research, and practice reflect an explicit commitment to understanding and eliminating social inequalities and attendant disparities in health of the public.

Diversity Committee Objectives

- Reinvigorate community conversations on issues of diversity on campus
- Create forums for such community conversations
- Assist in executing the newly released *Faculty Diversity Strategic Plan* objectives
- Recruitment, retention and improving climate
- Assist in developing a similar diversity strategic plan for staff (non-faculty)
- Foster engagement and interest in diversity-related topics among peers
- Improve engagement of students through enhanced curriculums
- Enhance resources for faculty and staff
- Encourage professional development opportunities
- Widen the outreach to targeted groups in academic disciplines & administration

Highlights:

- Introduction of a new role, Associate to the Provost for Faculty Affairs, championing several institutional services for diverse faculty through the Teaching and Learning Center (TLC)
- Establishment of a Junior Faculty Mentoring Program (JFMP) by Academic Affairs, with a concentrated effort to recruit Black, Hispanic and Asian/Pacific Islander faculty
- Diversity Committee, Office of the CDO and Academic Affairs sponsorship of a college leadership training on diversity and inclusion, Nov. 3, 2017

Recruitment

- Provided professional development trainings on structured interviewing and unconscious bias
- Integrated diversity hiring training into orientation of Department Chairs; Diversity hiring and retention for all department personal committee members
- Offering Best Practices Workshop for Committee Chairs, Sept. 8th
- Developed strategic and on-going efforts to diversify applicant pool, i.e., advertising widely, outreach to HBU and HSI doctoral programs
- CDO's (Chief Diversity Officer) office monitors job descriptions, offers training, monitors diversity in search committees, fair review practices, supports the garnering of a diverse applicant pool
- CDO and diversity committee members attend workshops by CUNY's Office of Recruitment and Diversity

Retention

New Role, Associate to the Provost for Faculty in collaboration with TLC delivered a number of initiatives

- Year long seminar in grant writing for faculty and mentors
- Writing boot camp jump starting research
- Workshops on tenure and promotion
- Workshops on moving from associate professor to full

Retention

Junior Faculty Mentoring Program (JFMP)

- Nine mentors and Nine mentees
- Mentor training
- Workshops on building research networks, successful teaching, choosing service strategically
- Handbook for Chairs on supporting and mentoring faculty
- Robust orientations and development opportunities; information on tenure and promotion
- Knowledge-sharing scholarly initiatives
- Celebrating and publicizing faculty accomplishments
- Centralizes and disseminates information on professional development opportunities, grants, awards, fellowship

Improve Climate

- Created a disrupting implicit bias working group
- Offered a weekly lunch program to bring faculty together in support of community
- Planned a reception celebrating the special contribution to the college by faculty of Color
- Disseminated the Provost's affinity group Listservs for Black, Latino/a, Asian, Asian American, and LGBTQ faculty
- Provided confidential meeting space
- Provided information to Department Chairs and P&B committees on how to increase diversity in faculty hiring to support the College's HSI identity
- Disseminated information and supported the submission of abstracts to diversity-related conferences
- Supported faculty to attend cultural competency training opportunities
- Developed an online climate assessment survey, assessing climate and satisfaction of diversity initiatives, identify barriers, recommend changes

We're nowhere near being done...

- How do we continue to live out our mission—educating for justice, fierce advocates for justice? Meet and expand our diversity objectives? Build on our achievements?
- Create an college that is representative of those we serve
- Move the college to one of a truly "diverse", inclusive and equitable environment where all can work and contribute to their full potential
- Recruitment and retention strategies *can be* key to accomplishing this goal
- To do so we must move beyond just "diversity" as we know it

Beyond Diversity

- Beyond diversity, cultural competence, multiculturalism -cultural humility, cultural safely, white fragility, anti-racist work
- Not "Diversity Light"
- Not holding hands and singing we are the world
- Issues of power and privilege
- A historical and structural analysis
- Oppression
- Dominance
- "Top Gun: The Need to Lead"; White faculty and administration must learn how to follow people of Color

An expanded definition

Diversity, generally understood and embraced, is not casual liberal tolerance of anything and everything not yourself. It is not polite accommodation instead, diversity is, in action, the sometimes painful awareness that other people, other races, other voices, other habits of mind, have as much integrity of being, as much claim on the world as you do...We are meant to be here together.

-William M. Chase, "The Language of Action"

A Human Rights Framework

- Uma Narayan's words, "Don't treat people as objects of rescue but as intellectual collaborators and political allies"
- Where we locate ourselves
- Learning to follow
- Those we serve as expert
- Those we serve have the power to define their own experience

Some Key Concepts

- An anti-racist analysis: historical and structural
- Micro-aggressions/insults, macro-aggressions, micro-trauma
- Historical trauma
- The mind sciences
- Racial, ethnic, gender/sex, sexual orientation identity theory
- Intersectionality that doesn't leap over dominant dimensions
- Power and privilege; white privilege, supremacy and superiority
- Internalized racial inferiority and superiority
- Double consciousness
- Systems of dominance and oppression
- Ongoing, continuous analysis: Are we part of the problem or part of the solution?

• Nothing replaces representation....

Stages of Multicultural Organizational Development

• Stage One: Different Jobs for Different People

• Stage Two: The Law Drives Diversity

 Stage Three: A Truly Multiculturally Competent, Diverse Organization

Multiculturally Competent Organization

- Commitment from the top
- Mission statement
- Action plan
- Oversight team
- Feedback
- Accountability
- Evaluation criteria
- Mentoring and support networks
- Coalition building and networking
- Systematic and long-term commitment
- Organization is a reflection of the wider community
- Integration over Assimilation

Toward an Anti-Racist Multicultural Organization

- Continuum
 - Monocultural
 - Multicultural
 - Anti-Racist
 - Anti-Racist Multicultural
- From Racial and Cultural Differences Seen as Deficits to Seen as Assets
- From Exclusive to Fully Inclusive

 Best Practices for the Recruitment of Diverse Faculty

Recruitment: Hiring Committee Composition

- A *diverse hiring committee* is a critical factor in identifying and attracting a wide range of talented applicants
- Strategic efforts should be made to *recruit people of Color to serve on hiring committees* (at different stages in their identity development and racial consciousness, and reflective of the student population)
- It is essential that hiring committees engage in *professional development and training together*....training pitched at the level we're discussing today

Recruitment: Advertising

- **Define a hiring search** as **broadly** as possible to increase the chances of greater diversity in the applicant pool.
- Use Diverse Networks!
- Add *language* signaling a special interest in applicants who contribute to the college's diversity priorities (and mission statement)
- For example, one might say: "The hiring committee is especially interested in applicants who through their *leadership, community service, lived experience and/or research* will contribute to the diversity mission of the college."

- **Expanded recruitment efforts** produce diverse applicant pools. Hiring committees, for example, might directly contact graduate programs with high numbers of diverse candidates and utilize databases, fellowship directories, professional organizations that identify outstanding and diverse applicants.
- When asking colleagues at other organizations about potential applicants, always specifically ask: "Do you know outstanding applicants reflective of the population we serve at John Jay ?"
- Be alert for potential future graduates from schools where students are exposed to advanced diversity content and analysis as part of the curriculum as "*people to watch.*"
- Can we create a *database* for potential applicants reflective of the population we serve?

Recruitment: Hiring Processes

- Use a standardized applicant *evaluation form*. Make sure the form includes an assessment of the candidate's ability to support the college's diversity mission.
- **Discuss** these forms in hiring committee meetings. Rater accountability has been shown to increase the accuracy and objectivity of ratings—but we must make sure the these items are a part of what gets rated
- Encourage a discussion format that requires *contributions from all members.* Asking each member of the committee to comment on an applicant ensures that a vocal minority does not dominate the discussion. Open the meeting to all voices. This format also provides an incentive for everyone to "do their homework."
- Do not eliminate a name from the list for personal reasons. Often, qualified potential applicants are struck from the list based on assumptions about their personal life. Work with the college to have flexible work hours, *remove both formal and informal obstacles* that would eliminate important applicants.

How do we encourage a "discussion format "on hiring for a diverse faculty ?

- Our capacity to have these necessary, "recruiting for a diverse faculty" conversations in mixed company across race, skin color, ethnicity, gender, sex, sexual orientation, religion, language, disability, age, class, nationhood and geographic location *is another story?*
- How do we commit to and systematically work toward *increasing* our capacity to engage in these essential conversations?
- We get into trouble when we expect that we should *just know how*

- Letters of Recommendation: A study of over 300 recommendation letters for successful applicants for a healthcare organization found that letters for females were shorter, contained more "grindstone adjectives" such as "hardworking" and "diligent," contained twice as many "doubt raisers," and were less likely to include "stand-out" adjectives such as "brilliant" and "superb".
- Can we make *comparisons* for applicants of Color?

- **Performance Evaluation**: Social psychology research found that both men and women are more likely to hire a male applicant than a female applicant with an identical record; found that success is more frequently attributed to "skill" for males and "luck" for females, even when the evaluators are presented with evidence of equal success for both genders. Comparisons?
- Beginning in the 1970s symphony orchestras started requiring musicians to audition behind screens; since that time, the number of women hired has increased fivefold and the probability that a woman will advance from preliminary rounds has increased by 50%.
- Thus, "The Voice," was created!!

- For positions that require publications: A study of postdoctoral fellowships awarded by the Medical Research Council in Sweden found that women candidates needed *substantially more publications* to achieve the same rating as men, unless they personally knew someone on the panel.
- **Small Numbers:** Research has shown that women and People of Color are judged more fairly when they are at least 30% of the applicant pool. It's critical to work on creating a large pool of diverse candidates.

Train Against Bias

- Again, it is essential that hiring committees as they are formed are required to go through "beyond diversity" *training*, as we've defined
- Also, workshops need to specifically target content with examples of how the work of inclusion and diversifying the college is the work of a *lifetime*, and can only be correlated with success and excellence if rooted in a *structural and historical analysis.*

 Best Practices for the Retention of a Diverse Faculty

- Mentoring New Faculty: *Mentoring programs* significantly enhance the competency of new faculty, their ability to succeed and their potential to support the college's mission.
- Colleges can organize formal mentoring programs and workshops that assist with issues pertinent to new faculty. This is especially important for any new faculty who may not be included in *informal (and often dominant culture)* support networks.

Retention: Mentoring

- **Training for Mentors** has to include a "beyond diversity" framework as we've defined, with a challenging dialogues, self-awareness component. The mentor can be the key for the success of the new faculty member or not
- We need to "out" all the, "behind close doors," *informal mentoring* that goes on by people of Color for people of Color in the college. We need to out it, honor it, name it, value it and assign *workload credit* for it! And study it's impact on promotion, tenure, advancement, etc.
- Understand the impact of being the "only one" or one of few in the organization

Creating more effective mentors: Mentoring the mentors

- Gandhi & Johnson, UCSF, 2016, 2 day "Mentoring the Mentors" workshop to train mid-level and senior HIV researchers from around the country
- Workshop content used principles of Social Cognitive Career Theory (SCCT) and included training specifically geared towards working with early career investigators from underrepresented groups, including sessions on unconscious bias, microaggressions and diversity supplements (resiliency, self-awareness)
- Mentoring competency was measured using a validated tool before and after each workshops on 6 domains; all improved with training
 - Effective communication
 - Aligning expectations
 - Assessing understanding
 - Fostering independence
 - Addressing diversity
 - Promoting development

Creating more effective mentors: Mentoring the mentors

- Qualitative assessments indicated a greater awareness of the micro-insults and unconscious bias experienced by mentees of diversity and a commitment to improve awareness and mitigate these effects via the mentor-mentee relationship.
- Their workshop offers a formal and structured curriculum on best practices, tools and techniques of effective mentoring, and methods to mitigate unconscious bias in the mentoring relationship
- They found qualitative and quantitative improvements in mentoring skills, self reported after each workshop; they plan additional programs with longitudinal longer-term assessments focused on objective mentee outcomes (grants, papers, academic retention)
- Mentoring training can improve mentoring skills and is likely to improve outcomes for optimally-mentored mentees

Retention: Mentoring

- Giving *feedback* is essential to faculty success
- Who gets feedback, who doesn't?
- The literature tells us that people of Color are often *under-supervise*d in organizations
- **Training and accountability are key**: Are you evaluated and promoted by how well you mentor, supervise and provide feedback formally and informally to all your supervisees and mentees?
- We need *Diversity-Based Accountability*

Leadership

• Perhaps most important is the position that oversees faculty mentoring. It is essential that this person has an deep understanding, consciousness and expertise in "diversity" as we've defined it today

Retention: Transparency in Promotion

- The promotion process is not always objective. Colleges can develop and maintain *clearly established criteria* for granting promotion, and this information should be easily accessible by all employees.
- The criteria for gauging excellence should be wide and flexible, and acknowledge and value different kinds of excellence, and many ways of knowing
- Colleges should think about how they communicate expectations to faculty clearly and directly
- Promotion committees should *rotate membership and leadership* to ensure that the processes are fair and systematic. Who staffs these committees--who gets privileged through the staffing demographics?
- Control for *invisible advantages and privileges*

Retention: Development Programs

- Colleges can develop a variety of programs that *assist* faculty in their development. Examples include release time/workload relief for special projects or professional development outside the dominant box, that serves to level the playing field not overprivilege it and that values the many ways of knowing
- These programs could include faculty who have *just obtained promo*tion so that they can address the factors that contributed to successful careers.
- Administrators can promote external visibility of all faculty by helping them to establish networks outside of the college or providing opportunities for them to present at national meetings, conferences beyond the usual boundaries of what is valued

Retention: Climate of Inclusiveness and Fairness

- **Professional isolation** is often cited as a reason for leaving an organization.
- **Cluster Hire:** For representation and also support
- Informal social networks create a sense of community
- Ideas for building these *networks* include: holding regular college social events and lunches, acknowledging holidays and commemorative days across diverse lines.
- Demonstrate active *appreciation*
- Welcome/support the development of *affinity groups*. Dominant affinity groups are also essential in that there are different tasks for each group

Ken Hardy's Tasks...

• Tasks for Whites

- To resist false notions of equality. Not helpful equating suffering
- Intentions vs. consequences
- To challenge the ahistorical approach. The privileged cannot understand the subjugated out of context
- To develop thick skin
- To not become a FOE—framer of others' experiences
- Tasks for People of Color
 - To overcome learned voicelessness; to advocate for oneself
 - To learn to exhale the negative messages that have become internalized
 - To overcome the addiction to protect, educate or change the privileged
 - To deal with one's own rage, channel it appropriately, not to eradicate it

Tasks for us all

- To be the expert in your own experience, not of others
- To create space for the telling of one's story
- To make space for both thoughts and feelings

Retention: Data Collection

- **Exit interviews** provide the opportunity for understanding obstacles to retention and designing effective responses to the problems.
- Schools can conduct exit interviews led by faculty with an advanced diversity analysis to determine why a faculty member is leaving the institution, and to *identify retention problems* that have a negative impact on building a diverse faculty.

- Through regular *self-evaluation* colleges can avoid disparities in resources and salaries that influence retention.
- By regularly reviewing office space allocation, workload, informal mentoring, committee assignments, merit increases, leadership opportunities, and recognition, faculty of Color, in particular, are afforded *the same benefits and resources* as White faculty.
- To truly level the playing field, understand, assess and intervene to diminish *invisible advantages and privileges*; equity over equality

Retention: Flexible Policies and Practices

- **Flexible** family leave, work-life supports, alternative work schedules play a key role in retaining for a diverse faculty. Supports outside the box!
- Organizational responsiveness to the employment situation of a faculty member's *spouse/partne*r can have an impact on retention.
- Affordable and accessible *childcare* services as well as other benefits that assist employees in their role as parents are also key elements to retaining for a fully inclusive college.

• An example training model for White Mentors of UREM Mentees?

The literature on "mentoring the mentors" describes the need to increase White mentor consciousness of:

□ themselves as racial beings

□ their own power and privilege

□ Institutional (historical and structural) discrimination and oppression

□ the privileging of western culture, norms, values and criteria for success

□ in short, a double consciousness around the experience of mentees

Challenging Dialogues as a Model

- My work in challenging dialogues
- Relevance as a training model for White Mentors of UREM mentees
- Most important aspect of the work is in *increasing capacity* to:
 foster a consciousness that leads to understanding & action

□ create a mentor/mentee relationship of safety and trust

• work on dismantling systems that maintain unfair advantage

increase numbers of UREM faculty understanding that nothing replaces representation; we need numbers that better match the percentage of UREM's we serve

The Model

- A PowerPoint Conceptual Framework
 - □ Institution's Mission Statement
 - □ "Diversity and Inclusion" Mission Statement
 - Easier said than done!
 - How do we realize the mission if we can't engage in challenging dialogues on race, skin color, gender/sex, sexual orientation, disability, etc...
- A Structure that Supports the Complexity of the Work
- Affinity Group Exercises
- Other Exercises
- A Plan for Ongoing Work

Challenging Dialogues

- Nothing has prepared us to have these conversations in mixed company
- We've been encouraged not to
- We shouldn't expect that we should just know how
- We dishonor the work
- Would you trust an untrained, unpracticed surgeon?
- It takes a body of knowledge and skill ...
- ...and structures that serve to increase our capacity to tolerate the ambiguity and discomfort inherent in this work

Why do this work?

- Essential for the development of authentic cross-racial professional relationships
- Allows for a truly diverse, inclusive university
- Ensures retention of a diverse faculty
- Creates a climate where all "all can thrive" Allows everyone to work to their full potential

Knowledge Base for Challenging Dialogues

- Social Psychological Theories of Groupwork & Conflict Resolution
- Counseling Psychology's Theories of Racial, Ethnic, Gay and Lesbian Identity
- Black Feminist Theory
- Historical, Systemic and Structural Analysis
- Human Rights Philosophy
- Key Concepts: Microaggressions, Historical Trauma and the Mind Sciences
- Indigenous Knowledge
- Freire's concept of Praxis as Critical Consciousness and Social Action

• Through cross-cultural dialogue we confront the reality of cultural difference, rather than subsuming it under dubious claims to universality.

-Kristin Louise Savell in Crooms

 A key element of dialogical praxis (drawing from Freire) is "conscientisation," which can be described as the raising of consciousness through dialogue linking the personal and the political, in such a way that it opens up possibilities for action as people become more aware of the structures and the discourses that define and perpetuate oppression. • We have run away from race for far too long. We are so afraid of inflaming the wound that we fail to deal with what remains America's central social problem. We will never achieve racial healing if we do not confront each other, take risks, make ourselves vulnerable, put pride aside, say all the things we are not supposed to say in mixed company—in short, put on the table all of our fears, trepidations, wishes, and hopes. -Harlon L. Dalton

Conceptual Framework

Praxis: reflection and action upon the world in order to transform it

-Paulo Freire

Reflection and Action

There is an interdependence between critical consciousness and social action

Self, Social and Global Awareness

Promoting the praxis of critical consciousness means we need to pass through 3 levels of awareness:

- Centers on a **critical exploration** of ourselves as cultural beings
- And toward achieving an **aware and positive** cultural identity

Dimensions of Identity, Difference and Social Location

• Encourages us to explore **dimensions** of race, disability, ethnicity, skin color, class, gender, age, religion/spirituality, nationhood, sexual orientation, language, sex and geographic location (*not an exhaustive list*)

- Pays close attention to the **language of identity** knowing that words vary with time, location and the individual
- Reaches for **inclusiveness** under each dimension....

For example...

• Gender Identity

- Transgender
- Cisgender
- Gender ambiguous
- Gender non-conforming
- Gender variant
- Gender queer
- Androgynous
- Two-Spirited

...and it's not an exhaustive list

• Sex Identity

- Male
- Female
- Transsexual
- Intersex

...and it's not an exhaustive list

For example...

Sexual Orientation

- Straight
- Heterosexual
- Gay
- Lesbian
- Bi-Sexual
- Pansexual
- Asexual
- Homosexual
- Queer
- Questioning
- Two-spirited

...and it's not an exhaustive list

Self-Awareness

- Full awareness is facilitated by not merely celebrating these dimensions of identity but through an **analysis** which includes and embraces issues of power, privilege, oppression and dominance and their impact on us as well as on those we serve
- Key to self awareness is an understanding of how identity is closely tied to privilege, oppression and dominance through the use and/or misuse of power
- Once we see the connection between identity and power relationships, we develop a healthy self awareness that recognizes how oppression and privilege mark our own struggles and the struggles of others

Self Awareness...

...at the same time paying attention to the interdependence and permeable boundaries between all three

Microaggressions

- The brief and commonplace daily verbal, behavioral or environmental indignities, whether intentional or unintentional that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative racial slights and insults toward people of color or toward one's gender, sex or sexual orientation.
- Perpetrators of micro-aggressions are often unaware that they have engaged in such communications when they interact with people of color, or those of a different gender, sex or sexual orientation.
- Almost all interracial encounters are prone to micro-aggressions
- They create psychological dilemmas, a high degree of stress and physical health problems that continue to be documented in the literature
- They convey messages: "You don't belong, You are abnormal, You are intellectually inferior, You cannot be trusted, You are all the same..."

Historical Trauma

- Increasingly, understanding how the role of historical events and context affect present-day health inequities has become a dominant narrative among Native American communities.
- Consists of traumatic events targeting a community (e.g., forced relocation) that cause catastrophic upheaval, has been posited by Native communities and some researchers to have pernicious effects that persist across generations through a myriad of mechanisms from biological to behavioral.
- Consistent with contemporary societal determinants of health approaches, the impact
 of historical trauma calls upon researchers to explicitly examine theoretically and
 empirically how historical processes and contexts become embodied, affects current
 physical health, and affects the magnitude and distribution of health inequities

The past is not past!

The Mind Sciences

- Implicit Bias: the brain's automatic, instant association of stereotypes or attitudes toward particular groups, without our conscious awareness (unconscious bias) The split-second decisions our brains make (e.g. reactions to or assumptions about someone) without our realizing it
- Racial anxiety: the brain's stress response before or during inter-racial interactions.
 - For people of Color, racial anxiety happens when they fear they will experience bias from someone else, through discrimination, hostile treatment, or invalidation
 - For White people, racial anxiety happens when they fear their actions will be perceived as racist, or that they will be met with distrust or hostility
- Stereotype threat: the brain's impaired cognitive functioning when a negative stereotype is activated. We are worried about confirming a negative stereotype about ourselves. This gets in the way of our ability to perform a task.

...and let us acknowledge that such work is not easy...Listen hard, listen generously, risk making a mistake, risk being made uncomfortable, risk forgiveness

-Drew Faust, Harvard University

□ sustained commitment, concerted effort, and the attention of us all...

-Jean Howard, Professor, Former Vice Provost for Diversity, Columbia University • Thank you for listening....what do you think? where do we go from here?